

**H2020-SC6-CULT-COOP-2016-2017
CULT-COOP-11-2016-2017**

Co-VAL [770356] “Understanding value co-creation in public services for transforming European public administrations”



D9.4 Complete Co-VAL Dashboard

Project Reference No	Co-VAL [770356]
Deliverable	D9.4 Complete Co-VAL Dashboard
Workpackage	WP9 Sustainable policy impact
Type	R = Report
Dissemination Level	PU = Public
Date	31/05/2019
Status	Final v1.0
Author (s)	Stéphanie Lepczynski (LC)
Contributor(s)	A. Triantafillou (ATC)
Reviewer(s)	A. Triantafillou (ATC)
Document description	This document presents the first round of data collected in the framework of the policy dashboard that will enable collaborative monitoring of what governments are doing in implementing digital transformation and co-creation policies. Specifically, the deliverable will present a first analysis of the data collected, through desk research and activation of the Co-VAL Stakeholder Panel's network, at city and member state levels.

Document Revision History

Version	Date	Modifications Introduced	
		Modification Reason	Modified by
V0.1	30/05/2019	ToC drafting and document structure	LC
V0.2	31/05/2019	Initial draft	LC, ATC
V0.3	10/07/2019	Final draft	LC, ATC
V1.0	12/07/2019	Final version for submission to EC	ATC

Executive Summary

This document presents the first round of data collected in the framework of the policy dashboard that will enable collaborative monitoring of what governments are doing in implementing digital transformation and co-creation policies. Specifically, the deliverable presents a first analysis of the data collected, through desk research and activation of the Co-VAL Stakeholder Panel's network, at city and member state levels. At the member state level, the data has been collected in relatively digitally advanced administrations (Austria, Belgium, Denmark, France, the Netherlands, and Spain) according to the DESI Index, where digital transformation and co-creation practices are already well used. *Idem* at the city level, the pilot cities are big urban centres (Amsterdam, Madrid, Milan and Turin) where digital and co-creation practices are clearly a priority.

Table of Contents

- 1 INTRODUCTION.....5**
 - 1.1 PURPOSE AND SCOPE5
 - 1.2 STRUCTURE OF THE DELIVERABLE.....5

- 2 ANALYSIS OF THE DATA COLLECTED AT MEMBER STATE LEVEL6**
 - 2.1 OVERVIEW6
 - 2.2 THE FIVE DIMENSIONS OF THE DASHBOARD.....6
 - 2.2.1 *The Policy Level*6
 - 2.2.2 *Interoperability/Re-use*7
 - 2.2.3 *Collaboration*7
 - 2.2.4 *Skills*8
 - 2.2.5 *Monitoring*8

- 3 ANALYSIS OF THE DATA COLLECTED AT CITY LEVEL.....10**
 - 3.1 OVERVIEW10
 - 3.2 THE FIVE DIMENSIONS OF THE DASHBOARD.....10
 - 3.2.1 *The Policy Level*10
 - 3.2.2 *Interoperability/Re-use*11
 - 3.2.3 *Collaboration*11
 - 3.2.4 *Skills*12
 - 3.2.5 *Monitoring*12

- 4 NEXT STEPS.....13**

1 Introduction

This document presents the first round of data collected in the framework of the policy dashboard (<http://www.co-val.eu/dashboard/>) that will enable collaborative monitoring of what governments are doing in implementing digital transformation and co-creation policies. Specifically, the deliverable presents a first analysis of the data collected, through desk research and activation of the Co-VAL Stakeholder Panel's network, at city and member state levels. At the member state level, the data has been collected in relatively digitally advanced administrations (Austria, Belgium, Denmark, France, the Netherlands, Spain) according to the DESI Index, where digital transformation and co-creation practices are already well used. *Idem* at the city level, the pilot cities are big urban centres (Amsterdam, Madrid, Milan, and Turin) where digital and co-creation practices are clearly a priority. What messages can be drawn from the Co-VAL Dashboard with regards to policy, interoperability/re-use, collaboration, skills, and monitoring?

1.1 Purpose and Scope

As already mentioned in D9.1, D9.2, and D9.3, as part of WP7, the Lisbon Council will develop actionable policy recommendations, which will be then tracked through a dashboard that enables collaborative monitoring of what governments are doing in the collaborative digitalisation of public administration. More specifically, WP9 aims to ensure the recommendations developed in WP7 are translated into policy action by tracking at very granular level what the member states are doing. To this end, the consortium developed a dashboard enabling collaborative monitoring of what governments and municipalities are doing in implementing co-creation and digital transformation policies. The dashboard has been built based on the large experience accumulated by the Lisbon Council with the Startup Manifesto Policy Tracker and the e-Government Action Plan Evaluation. The first information has been inputted in the dashboard by the project partners. Experts from governments and from public administration already started to provide the data following the guidelines presented in D9.2. The tool includes interactive visualisation to make the results intuitive and appealing and enables rankings of government and municipalities activity.

1.2 Structure of the Deliverable

This report is divided into four chapters:

- Chapter 1 introduces the scope.
- Chapter 2 outlines and analyses the data collected at member state level.
- Chapter 3 proposes an overview of the data collected at city level.
- Chapter 4 sums up the next steps regarding the dashboard.

2 Analysis of the Data Collected at Member State Level

2.1 Overview

As already mentioned in D9.1, the exercise requires gathering granular data at the level of member states and at the local level, in order to enable cross-analysis. In this respect, the study team, together with experts from the member states and the cities, are collecting data about policy measures on digital transformation and co-creation, and the dashboard will provide a quick overview of the status of the member states and municipalities that will be involved in the Co-VAL project.

So far, data has been collected in six member states (Austria, Belgium, Denmark, France, the Netherlands, and Spain). The data has been collected by researchers from the Co-VAL team as well as by members of the Stakeholder Panel who are working for the government of the specific member states which are analysed. This synergy between the Co-VAL team and the Stakeholder Panel members is to be underlined, as it shows the interaction and dialogue between the project and the key players in governments.

The data covers the five dimensions of the dashboard, i.e. the policy level, interoperability/re-use, collaboration, skills, and monitoring. The five dimensions will be described below.

2.2 The Five Dimensions of the Dashboard

The structure of dashboard is based on a 2-level hierarchy: five dimensions and 18 indicators.

2.2.1 The Policy Level

This dimension of the Co-VAL Dashboard considers the participation to international networks and initiatives, as well as the consistency of the local digital government strategy with the EIF.

All members states for which data was gathered have a national digital plan. And according to the European Commission, they are well aligned with the European Interoperability Framework. For instance, according to the NIFO factsheet of the European Commission, the Spanish NIF "systematically links the interoperability instruments of Spain with the equivalent ones in the EU," "is fully aligned with the EIF on the 'Governance', the 'Principles' and the 'Interoperability Agreements', and has an almost full alignment on the 'Conceptual Model' and on the 'Interoperability levels.'" In the Netherlands, the Commission states that "the Dutch NIF is strongly aligned with the EIF on all dimensions." And in Denmark, "the Danish NIF is well aligned with the EIF on all dimensions. Especially the Principles [10 out of 12 principles], Conceptual Model and Interoperability Governance dimensions are closely aligned with the EIF."

However, when it comes to user involvement for the innovation projects that involve services, one can notice that usually, the words "co-creation," or "design thinking" are not mentioned in these digital plans. One can of course find some special initiatives which involve collaboration, such as in the French open and collaborative dashboard, where citizens are called on to notify to the administration which services haven't been digitalised yet (<https://monavis.numerique.gouv.fr/TableauDeBord/>), or the Austrian cross-agency platform where citizens can find immediate help and information on administrative issues (www.oesterreich.gv.at) – according to the administration, co-creation is applied in all current top priority projects which include citizen interfaces. Also, in the Spanish National Digital Agenda, "participation" is mentioned, and one can read that the "services must be thought and

designed focusing on the users.” But it would be wrong to claim that the use of co-creation is a reality for all innovation projects that involve services.

Raising awareness about co-creation and actually implemented it as a default setting remains an objective to be enforced for many administrations.

2.2.2 Interoperability/Re-use

This dimension of the Co-VAL Dashboard deals with the ability of the public administration to share information and knowledge with other administration, by mean of the exchange of data between ICT systems. For the purpose of the dashboard, interoperability entails also the re-use of software and service components.

Some administrations are at the vanguard of data exchange. For instance, the Flemish MAGDA platform (<https://overheid.vlaanderen.be/magda>) is used for the exchange of data between federal and regional base registries and Flemish government entities that want to adhere to the ‘once only’ principle. Through the Basic Data Programme, Danish registers, such as the Civil Registration System, the Central Business Register, and the Building and Dwelling Register are standardised so the data can be combined and used coherently <http://grunddata.dk/english/>. Dataoverheid.nl (<https://data.overheid.nl>) is the Dutch open data portal that provides access to national datasets. In Spain, the Center for Semantic Interoperability (CISE, in Spanish) is an initiative defined by the National Interoperability frame, which is in charge of making the data models and interoperability elements allowing information interchange among public administrations and between these and the citizens. It is accessible for all public administrations and anyone working in the interoperability area.

When it comes to providing centralised service modules to local authorities, the key to access them is usually the eID. For instance, in Austria, a federal ID service is used by all relevant government applications (<https://www.buergerkarte.at/en/index.html>), from where one can get access to all federal registries such as the population register, professional register, land charge register, etc. In Denmark, local authorities' services are accessible via NemID, the official digital signature for public digital services (soon to become MitID) <https://en.digst.dk/digitisation/eid/>

Payment is also an important function for government. In Spain, for instance, the initiative "red.es " (from the Ministry of Economy and Business) offers to all public organisations a standardised and secure service for managing electronic payments.

2.2.3 Collaboration

This dimension entails the involvement of users in the creation and design of services, as well as the acceptance of trust services for using the services provided by the public administration.

Regarding the initiatives put in place to involve users in the design of services, one should differentiate between **co-design**, i.e. when users participate actively by providing feedback and ideas, and **co-production**, where they actively take part in the implementation of the service. And the most frequent type of co-creation initiatives in the six member states seems to be co-design. In Belgium, given the complexity of the Belgian government, it's difficult for the users to really co-produce a solution, hence, they are rather involved in the testing phase, providing feedback on the prototypes proposed by the

Digital Transformation Office or other FPSs (e.g. for MyProfile). Also, the Administrative Simplification Agency (ASA) operates the www.kafka.be website which allows citizens and companies to give feedback and flag issues in the delivery of public services. It's also the case in France with the already mentioned open and collaborative dashboard, where citizens are called on to notify to the administration which services haven't been digitalised yet. In Denmark, MindLab was the world's first public innovation lab, which clearly gave users an active role in co-producing the public services.

Perhaps unsurprisingly, all the member states for which data has been collected so far accept the use of qualified trust services in line with the eIDAS regulation. This shows the success of the transposition rate of this flagship European regulation.

2.2.4 Skills

Digitalisation of – and collaboration in – the public sector can only happen if the workforce is prepared for change. This dimension of the Co-VAL Dashboard hence considers the acquisition of skills by the public administration, by mean of training of civil servants, as well as by mean of hiring managing personnel from private companies.

In some member states, bringing top management from the private sector to lead a digital department is not the new normal but at least is a trend, like in Denmark and in Austria. Belgium was a pioneer because already in 2001 when the federal agency for information- and communication technology (FEDICT, which is now known as BOSA's DG Digital Transformation, or Digital Transformation Office) was created, half of the staff came from the private sector. Unfortunately, the trend didn't survive. Within the administration, digital managers and design thinking managers may have had a private sector experience but today, the human resources department (BOSA) is reluctant to hire from the private sector, according to digital managers from the Digital Transformation Office. That being said, CEOs from private companies were appointed as advisers to the digital minister (the Digital Minds for Belgium) but they kept an external role.

Training public servants on digital matters is also becoming more common in the studied members states. For instance, in France, they plan to open the Public Transformation University, dedicated to accompanying and training project managers which are leading transformation projects, especially in the user centricity methods, agility and innovation, digital transformation. In Belgium, the *Institut de Formation de l'Administration Fédérale* proposes IT trainings for all staff levels to be followed alone (e-learning) or in group.

2.2.5 Monitoring

The final dimension of the Co-VAL Dashboard deals with the monitoring of activities implemented by the public administration by mean of KPIs. Beside the data, governments add evidence and other qualitative information, including suggesting best practice for each indicator.

According to the data collected so far, monitoring co-creation is far from the rule at the member state level and it varies a lot. In some countries, where monitoring exists, it's more related to digital government indicators, such as in Belgium, with the Digital Dashboard <https://digitaldashboard.belgium.be/en>. In France, the Digital Public Services Dashboard measures

usage rate and satisfaction rate about the digitalised channels
<https://www.modernisation.gouv.fr/home/tableau-de-bord-des-services-publics-numeriques-edition-2017>.

3 Analysis of the Data Collected at City Level

3.1 Overview

So far, data has been collected in four leading European cities (Amsterdam, Madrid, Milan, and Turin).

In Amsterdam, the data has been gathered by the office of the Chief Information Officer. In Milan, the team of the counsellor for digital affairs took responsibility for putting together the data. And in Turin, the deputy mayor for innovation was directly involved. In all the three cases, the project has been undertaken at a very high-level of responsibility, showing the importance for the cities to become part of the Co-VAL community, via the dashboard, and to be seen as a pioneer in the kick-start phase of the tool.

As for the member state level, the data covers the five dimensions of the dashboard, i.e. the policy level, interoperability/re-use, collaboration, skills, and monitoring, which are translated into 19 indicators. The five dimensions will be described below.

3.2 The Five Dimensions of the Dashboard

3.2.1 The Policy Level

The four cities, Amsterdam, Madrid, Milan, and Turin, are well connected urban hubs that value international and European networks on digital government.

Milan spearheads an initiative called Digital Bridges, where the city makes partnership and connections with top European and international cities that excel in digital services. For instance, Stockholm helped Milan pushing for digital payments, and in exchange, Milan helped Stockholm with an Industry 4.0 agenda. Tel-Aviv offered strategic advices on security platforms while Milan shared insights on their women in STEM and ICT careers strategy. The strategy behind the Digital Bridges is to make sure Milan can compare itself against the best in class and improve accordingly.

Amsterdam is lead partner in SCORE (Interreg project for open source and code for public services), Smart City networks, Resilience Network, Cities Coalition for Digital Rights, CGCC (a network of City CTO's and CIO's) and City Protocol. While Turin is an active player in Horizon 2020 projects.

This high-level of connectivity translates into a vibrant participation of the three cities in digital government projects: 15 in the past five years for Milan, five for Amsterdam and more than 18 for Turin.

The three cities are also very keen on including co-creation methodology in their projects that involve services. In particular, Amsterdam stresses the importance of user involvement in its digital agenda, Information vision (I-visie Amsterdam) and its privacy policy: service design, co-creation and user involvement are used where possible, essentially in the customer service department. And Turin has a dedicated digital platform for social involvement and co-creation (<https://torino.wegovnow.eu/#/>).

The city of Madrid doesn't have specific digital government strategy for the city, only a "government plan," but this one includes some actions such as transparency, open government and data re-use –

specifically, the municipality of Madrid has a portal (<https://datos.madrid.es>) for accessing open and interoperable data. And the regional government of Madrid designed a strategic digital plan, which focuses on the development of user centered services, transparency, open government and open and interoperable data. These plans address citizen participation in decision making and user centered services as main goals.

3.2.2 Interoperability/Re-use

Amsterdam, Madrid, Milan and Turin are making their base registries accessible to other public administrations.

In Italy, the Digital Transformation National Team created an APP IO channel where base registries are made available – and Milan uses it. They make their population register, property taxes and car pass for residents registers available. As of 30 April 2019, 160 APIs were available to other administrations and private companies. In Turin, public and public-private bodies use services via APIs developed by the local authority (most of them are services called “*servizi in cooperazione applicative*”).

In Amsterdam, the base registries are published online through data.amsterdam.nl – they also publish there around 60 APIs that can be used by other administrations or private companies.

In Madrid, the policy of open data is quite extensive. API REST offers dozens of databases in different formats and operations (<https://datos.madrid.es/portal/site/egob/menuitem.214413fe61bdd68a53318ba0a8a409a0/?vgnnextoid=b07e0f7c5ff9e510VgnVCM1000008a4a900aRCRD&vgnnextchannel=b07e0f7c5ff9e510VgnVCM1000008a4a900aRCRD&vgnnextfmt=default>). The open-data web portal of Madrid offers a repository with 25 apps developed by business and entrepreneurs independent from the public administration (<https://datos.madrid.es/portal/site/egob/menuitem.400a817358ce98c34e937436a8a409a0/?vgnnextoid=994612b9ace9f310VgnVCM100000171f5a0aRCRD&vgnnextchannel=994612b9ace9f310VgnVCM100000171f5a0aRCRD&vgnnextfmt=default>).

3.2.3 Collaboration

As to the collaboration indicators, Amsterdam, Madrid, Milan and Turin are pioneering cities.

In Milan, they ran about 10 co-creation exercises per year for the past five years. They use co-creation in several domains, including in IT, where they insert user centric co-creation with employees and citizens in all new projects.

In Amsterdam, they ran 30+ co-creation exercises for the past five years. Examples of the projects they ran include Amsterdam Smart City (<https://amsterdamsmartcity.com/projects>), a platform for users to share their smart city development projects on digital, energy, mobility, circular economy, governance and education, and citizenship and living. For every app used by civil servants and residents, they involve users in the design.

In Turin, they ran 5 co-creation exercises only for the year 2018. They also run a citizen portal called “*torinofacile*” (easy Turin), where more than 25,000 transactions were issued entirely digitally, out of the 200,000

In Madrid, developing user-centered services is among the main goals in the 2015-2019 government plan. One of the most important tools to do so is a web portal (<https://decide.madrid.es/>) that allows citizen to take part in deciding future policies, government actions, and services.

3.2.4 Skills

The four cities also put a special attention to the skills of their staff.

To stimulate the teams, Amsterdam, Madrid, and Milan brought personnel from the private sector in management positions. For instance, the digital counsellor of Milan comes from the business sector.

They also make sure that all the staff has access to training on digital matters such as document management, interoperability, data protection, etc. via several internal links or training sessions.

3.2.5 Monitoring

On monitoring, the picture is less clear.

Milan uses KPIs to monitor digital government, via the “penetration index” (<http://dati.comune.milano.it/rendiconto/home.html>) which represents the percentage of use of digital services compared to traditional ones. But they don’t monitor specifically for user’s co-creation, they don’t have special indicators for the collaborative dimension of their work.

In Amsterdam, on the contrary, they don’t use KPIs to monitor digital government but have KPIs that include co-creation, such as in the Mijn Amsterdam project.

In Turin, the monitoring is not systematic. They only partially monitor digital government projects with specific KPIs, sometimes including adoption rate of online services and they only partially include KPIs on users’ co-creation, such as in the MONICA (Management Of Networked of IoT Wearables) pilot project (<https://www.monica-project.eu/>), which will demonstrate the relevance of technology solutions at concerts, festivals, sporting events, where 10,000 citizens are called on to engage in the evaluation process.

For Madrid, the information was not available.

These are only four specific case uses of course, but it’s striking to see that collaborating and digitalising government doesn’t go necessarily together at the moment.

4 Next Steps

This report is a first stock taking on the data gathered in the Co-VAL Dashboard for six European Union member states and four leading European cities.

As already mentioned, initially the data gathering has been carried out by the consortium members which populated the dashboard using the available recent reports and policy documents. In the meantime, the consortium started to select a series of experts belonging to the public administrations providing the data. Such experts provide additional data from national reports and other information sources. The information is directly uploaded on the web tracker, and after accurate quality check, it becomes visible on the dashboard. All the data provided in the dashboard is open for review and for comments, in order to ensure the highest level of precision possible.

With regards to the next steps, these are outlined in the following table. It has to be noticed that “Reporting of the piloting activity” is not a contractual deliverable. However, we believe it would be important to have feedback from the piloting activity also for the benefit of other tasks of the project.

Table 1 – Next Steps

Activity	Due date
Final recruitment of Stakeholders for data collection	M24 – October 2019
Maintaining and updating the Co-VAL Dashboard	M24 – October 2019
D9.5.1 – First yearly report	M24 – October 2019